

# Citizens for Justice and Peace

May14, 2010

## PRESS NOTE

The Citizens for Justice and Peace (CJP) through its Secretary Teesta Setalvad filed detailed Documentary Evidence Before the Nanavati-Mehta Commission.

**Individual Graphs of These Tables of Phone calls made and received and made by 44 Persons Including Nine Persons from the Chief Minister's Office (CMO)**

**I. The Individual Graph of these 44 Phone Calls Reveal the Following:**

- 1. Chief Minister's Office (CMO) makes 15 calls to Commissioner of Police Ahmedabad P.C.Pande while the city was aflame and the CP did not move out of his office after 11 am at all.**

**Conclusion: Calls were Directly Co-Related to Instructions to Top Echelons of the Police not to Act.**

- 2. CMO's Office is in Contact with VHP Gujarat General Secretary Dr Jaideep Patel (now an accused in both the Naroda Patiya and Naroda Gaam massacres) several times on February 28, 2002. The CM's Office Nos phone Records show such a contact 5 times with Sanjay Bhavsar twice and with Tanmay Mehta once.**

**Conclusion:** For the CMO to be directly in touch with the man entrusted to bring the bodies of the Godhra victims back to Ahmedabad and moreover the man accused of leading and inciting the massacres and rapes in the Naroda Patiya and Gaam areas suggests collusion of the CM in the violence at the highest level.

- 3. Records of then Minister for Health Ashok Bhatt also show him in conversation with Dr Jaideep Patel**
- 4. Records of then MOS Home Govardhan Zadaphiya show him to be in touch with both Jaideep Patel and Dinesh Togadia, brother of Praveen Togadia and Manager of the Dhanvantri Hospital, Ahmedabad.**
- 5. Details of the Phone Calls Records Analysis of the CP PC Pande, Joint CP MK Tandon, Additional CP Shivanand Jha, then first PI Meghaninagar KG Erda have been given in detail separately in the Application.**
- 6. Amit Shah later to become MOS Home and then Chairman of the Ahmedabad District Cooperative Bank was in touch with Shivanand Jha that day (28.2.2002). Besides, Dr Maya Kodnani (then MLA and later Minister for Women and Child Welfare when she was arrested in 2009) and Minister Kaushik Jamnadas Patel were in touch with Jha,**
- 7. DCP Zone IV PB Gondia was in touch with h Dr Maya Kodnani, Jaideep Patel and Nimesh Patel.**
- 8. First PI Meghaninagar KG Erda was among others also in touch with Dr Maya Kodnani and Nimesh Patel**
- 9. First PI Naroda KK Mysorewala was in touch with Dr Maya Kodnani, Jaideep Patel among others. His phone call records show relatively few phone calls recorded that day.**
- 10. The Two Police station Numbers for Meghaninagar Police station that was the Police Station where the Gulberg Society was located has recorded just two phone calls from mobile phones in the whole day that day.**

**11. BJP State President, Rajendrasingh Rana is also in touch with both Dr Maya Kodnani and Jaideep Patel that day.**

**12. ACCUSED TO ACCUSED CONTACTS on 28.2.2002**

- i) The Individual Graphs of the Phone call Analysis also show that those Accused of Violence in the Naroda Patiya and Naroda Gaam Massacres (like Babu Bajrangi) and Atul Vaidya (Gulberg Society) were in touch with each other. Analysis of the Records for 28.2.2002 show that Bajrangi was in touch with Atul Vaidya, Jaideep Patel, Naresh Bhatia and Govind Patel.**
- ii) Maya Kodnani (then MLA) was in touch with Police Officers DCP Jebalia and Gondia, Additional CP Shivanand Jha, PI Meghaninagar KG Erda, Deputy Prime Minister and then Union Home Minister LK Advani's office, Dinesh Togadia (Manager of Dhanvantri Hospital, brother of Praveen Togadia), co-accused Jaideep Patel and Nimesh Patel.**
- iii) Jaideep Patel was in touch with the CMO, Ministers Ashok Bhatt and Govardhan Zadaphiya, DCP Gondia, BJP President Rajendrasing Rana and co-accused Maya Kodnani and Babu Bajrangi.**
- iv) Atul Vaidya accused in the Gulberg Society Massacre was in touch with VHP leaders Kamlesh Agarwal, Ajaysingh Balisatarsingh Rajput, Dinesh Bhoidas Patel and Babu Bajrangi.**
- v) Nimesh Patel was in touch with Mayabehn Kodnani and DCP PB Gondia.**

II. 27.2.2010

Graphs Showing Locations of Important Persons at MEGHANINAGAR AND NARODA --Key Locations that Burned the Next Day

MEGHANINAGAR

What were Six Persons from the CMO, Anil Mukhim, OP Singh, Tanmay Mehta, Sanjay Bhavsar, AP Patel and JM Thakkar doing in the Meghaninagar area between 1400 to 1700 hours on 27.2.2002 while CM Modi was at Godhra?

Health Minister Ashok Bhatt and Tanmay Mehta were at Narol Naroda between 0900 hours and 1700 hours on 27.2.2002 (Other Reports say that Ashok Bhatt was at Godhra so did he leave his Mobile Phone behind?)

It was at these very locations that violence spilt over, in broad daylight the next day as Policemen watched

III. 28.2.2010

Startlingly, on the day of the GULBERG MASSACRE/NARODA PATIYA AND GAAM MASSACRES, persons from the CMP, Ministers Ashok Bhatt and IK Jadeja, ACS Ashok Narayan and even DGP Chakravarti are shown through an Analysis of the Mobile Phone Records to be Located in these areas of Ahmedabad City.

Early Morning (5.10 am) Ashok Bhatt Narol, Naroda

Afternoon (3.41 p.m.) Ashok Narayan Narol Naroda

Afternoon (3.56 p.m.) Tanmay Mehta (CMO) Narol, Naroda

Afternoon (3.56 p.m.) IK Jadeja, Meghaninagar

Evening (5.10 p.m., 5.14 p.m., 5.57 p.m.) Ashok Bhatt Narol, Naroda

Evening 5.40 p.m. AP Patel (CMO) Meghaninagar

Evening 7.24 p.m. Harsh Brahmbutt (CMO) Narol Naroda

Evening 7.26 p.m. Harsh Bahmbutt (CMO) Meghaninagar

#### IV. LOCATIONAL EVIDENCE OF MEETINGS AT CM'S RESIDENCE

Graphs Showing Locations of Persons from the CMO and Senior Policemen in and around the Gandhinagar area (CM's Residence) corroborating the fact that secret/illegal meetings did take place there where instructions to allow free reign to the organized mobs led by men of the VHP/Bajrang Dal are alleged to have been given-

Koba Circle, Gandhinagar CMO + CP Pande 27.2.2002 Late Evening

Koba Circle, Gandhinagar CMO + Maya Kodnani + Chakravarti 28.2.2002 Morning

V. Time Zonal Locational Graphs for 28.2.2002, the Day of the Worst Massacres in Ahmedabad city post the Godhra Carnage that indicate the common locations of key persons at certain times of that day-

These Time Zonal Analysis of 28.2.2010 reveal the following:

##### THE BUILD UP

##### A. Between 0500 hours and 1000 hours on 28.2.2002

- i) Mobile Phone Records Show then Health Minister Ashok Bhatt to be in and around Kailash Complex, Naroda
- ii) Mobile Phone Records of Babu Bajrangji show him in and around the Kailash Complex, Naroda
- iii) Then MLA Maya Kodnani is at Gandhinagar and back (-8 am)
- iv) DGP Chakravarti also at Gandhinagar in the early morning between 7 and 8 a.m.

## **THE MASSACRE**

### **B. Between 1000 hours and 1500 hours on 28.2.2002**

- (I) CP PC Pande is shown in the Shahibaug Kedar Towers Area from where he could have visited Gulberg Society**
- (II) DCP Gondia despite several emergency calls is out of his Zone of Responsibility**
- III) Accused MLA Maya Kodnani is in the Naroda area at 9.36 a.m. and then again right from 12 noon to 1648 hours**
- IV) Accused Jaideep Patel is also in the Naroda area from 10.11 am to 11.18 a.m. after which he dashed to the Vishal Diamond Factory area where it is believed that a high level meeting took place**
- V) Accused Babu Bajrangi is also in the Naroda area from 9.36 a.m. to 14.34 p.m.**
- VI) Between 13.54 -14.54 p.m. both Addl CP Shivanand Jha And Amit Shah are in the location of Bhavan's College, Shahpur and Paradise, Nr Mirzapur Circle**
- VII) Only one Phone Number of the CMO shows Calls during his critical period (Massacre Time) – OP Singh at 1.03 p.m. located in or around Sakkar II, Opp Town Hall. Were all CMO numbers that were Traceable Through the Whole Day Switched off at this Critical Time?**

## **POST THE KILLING**

### **C. Between 1500 hours and 17.30 hours on 28.2.2002**

- I) From 3.55 p.m. to 5.10 p.m. DGP Chakravarti is located in or around Shahibaug Kedar Towers (near the Shahibaug Control Room or the Circuit House Annexe where a Top Level Meeting took place).**
- II) PK Mishra PS to the CM is also located here between 4.19 p.m. and 5.27 p.m.**

III) Anil Mukhim Additional Principal Secretary to the CM is also located here between 4.09 and 4.59 p.m.

IV) Tanmay Mehta, PA to the CM is also located here between 15.50 and 17.45 p.m. (This area could also cover Gulberg/Naroda)

V) JM Thakkar also from the CMO is in this area between 5.25 p.m. and 5.30 p.m.

VI) Maya Kodnani is also here between 4.14-4.44 p.m. and before that she is at Kailash Complex Naroda (3.16 p.m.-4.05 p.m.

VII) Between 3.41 p.m. and 5.36 p.m Babu Bajrangi's call records also show him to be located in or around Kailash Complex Naroda.

VIII) OP Singh Pa to the CM is also here at Shahibaug at 4.05 p.m.

IX) Sanjay Bhavsar, OSD to the CM is also in the same area, Shahibaug Kedar Towers between 4.10 p.m.-5.28 p.m.

X) From 15.50 p.m. to 17.16 AP Patel, PA to the CM is also in this area.

XI) From 4.16-5.23 a.m. Ashok Bhatt then health Minister is also in this area (could be in the Control Room or Annexe).

XII) From 3.56 p.m. to 5.30 p.m. IK Jadeja Minister is also shown to be here.

XIII) From 3.55 to 4.06 p.m. Ashok Narayan, ACS Home is also shown to be in this area.

## **TAKING STOCK**

### **D. Between 1730 hours and 1930 hours on 28.2.2002**

- I) FROM 7.24 P.M. onwards Harsh Brahmbutt part of the CMO is located at Kailash Complex Naroda and Shayona Plaza Meghaninagar (Tehelka's Operation Kalank had caught Suresh Langda Chara an accused on camera stating that the Chief Minister had visited the Naroda area around this time and garlanded the men who had committed the rapes and killings

- II) From 17.31 to 17.22 hours Babu Bajrangi is within the Kailash Complex area
- III) OP Singh PA to the CM is also here at 17.37 hours and AP Patel PA to the CM is also here around 17.35 p.m.
- IV) Amit Shah is also in the vicinity of Shahibaug Kedar Towers at 19.27 p.m. and Health Minister Ashok Bhatt and BJP State President Rajendra Singh Rana too

#### **PLANNING FOR ROUND TWO**

- E. Between 1930 hours and 2300 hours on 28.2.2002
  - I) Tanmay Mehta PA to the CM is in and around the Premier House near Thaltej and then around the Sambhav Building at Vastrapur
  - II) Maya Kodnani is in and around Shahibaug, Paradise, Near Mirzapur and in and around Capri Hotel, Laldarwaza.
  - III) Accused Jaideep Patel is between the area of Vishal Diamond, Bapunagar and Kailash Complex Naroda
  - IV) Accused Babu Bajrangi is between Kailash Complex, Naroda and Rajkamal Complex, Thakkarnagar
  - V) Harsh Brahmbutt, CMO is between Revji bhai Towerssambaug and Vijay Complex Ghodasar

#### **VI. How Gujarat's Top Cops Deserted Residents of Gulberg Society**

**Where were the Top Cops when Armed Mobs Surrounded and Attacked Gulberg Society?**

##### **Commissioner of Police PC Pande**

Curfew was declared in the Meghaninagar area where the Gulberg Society is located at 12.54 pm (according to the Police Control Room Records – PCR). By then, according to data of the PCR itself, the Gulberg Society had already been surrounded by a mob of 4-5,000



armed with weapons. (12.38 p.m., PCR Records). In law, the Commissioner of Police, PC Pande has the responsibility of declaring curfew on time.

At 2.09 p.m. PI Meghaninagar KG Erda even asked for Central Paramilitary Forces but the PCR records show no deployment of paramilitary forces in the area till late in the evening, a decision that should have been taken by the Commissioner of Police, PC Pande.

### **Joint Commissioner of Police, Sector II, MK Tandon**

He finds himself more comfortable in the Revdi Bazar area between 2 and 3 p.m. immediately after he received a call from his boss, Commissioner of Police PC Pande informing him of the attack on the residents of the Gulberg Society in the Meghaninagar area. (Revdi Bazar is five kilometres away from the Gulberg Society)

When the PCR sent a message to Tandon mentioning that Shri Ahsan Jafri and other residents of the Gulberg society were in danger, Tandon was still seen in Revdi Bazar area which was apparently calm, with no incidents of violence.

In spite of Meghaninagar PI KG Erda desperately seeking additional deployment at Gulberg around 2.30 p.m. MK Tandon leaves the Revdi Bazar area only after he was ordered to do so by City Police Commissioner, PC Pande around 3 p.m. Ironically, Revdi Bazar where Tandon appears to have sought asylum falls under the jurisdiction of his counterpart Shivanand Jha who during those crucial minutes was in the comfort of his own office at Shahibaug.

### **DCP Zone IV, P.B. Gondia**

Not only did Tandon shy away from the engulfed and burning Gulberg society, even his deputy, DCP Zone IV, PB Gondia inspite of being repeatedly informed by PCR (Police Control Room) about the attack on Gulberg Society stayed away from the worst affected areas and from attending to the helpless cries of residents. He preferred to stay at the Kuber Nagar area, 6 kilometres away.

Gondia arrives at the Gulberg Society a few minutes before 2 p.m. on that fateful day only to leave the place in less than one hour, leaving a free way of passage to the armed mob. Later that afternoon Gondia moves to the Kalupur area which does not come under his jurisdiction.

The safety of the entire Meganinagar area during the most crucial periods of the day, from 11.30 a.m.-3.30 p.m. was left on PI KG Erda's shoulders despite the fact that Erda had himself asked the PCR to inform his bosses about the gravity of the situation and also to ensure that senior officers remain physically present as things were beyond his control. Today, KG Erda is an accused in the trial but PB Gondia, MK Tandon and PC Pande have escaped the investigator's net.

Clearly evident is the fact that the top Gujarat officers turned a deaf ear and a blind eye to the pleas of victims under attack for reasons best known to them. The entire Meghaninagar area was left unmanned by senior police personnel even when a residential society along with a neighbouring police chowky were set afire leading to huge casualties. Among the 70 persons maimed, massacred and burnt to ashes, were former parliamentarian Shri Ahsan Jafri.

**(Source: Phone Call Records Analysis Co-Related with PCR Records)**

**VII. Locational Graphs of areas in and around Mobile Tower Locations like  
Shayona Plaza, Meghaninagar, Kailash Complex, Narol, Naroda,  
Shahibaug Kedar Towers, Vishal Diamond Factory, Sambhav Building,  
Sears Towers, Zydeus Gandhinagar**

**ATTACHED IS THE LONG SUBMISSIONS (PART ONE) SUBMITTED  
TODAY**

**Detailed Colour Graphs are Available for Anyone Interested**

**Teesta Setalvad**

**Secretary**

**(09821314172)**